

1 GARY M. RESTAINO  
2 United States Attorney  
3 District of Arizona

4 TODD KIM  
5 Assistant Attorney General  
6 Environment & Natural Resources Division  
7 U.S. Department of Justice

8 ANDREW A. SMITH (NM Bar No. 8341)  
9 Senior Trial Attorney  
10 Natural Resources Section  
11 c/o United States Attorney's Office  
12 201 Third Street N.W., Suite 900  
13 P.O. Box 607  
14 Albuquerque, New Mexico 87103  
15 Phone: (505) 224-1468  
16 andrew.smith@usdoj.gov

17 *Attorneys for the United States (additional counsel on signature page)*

18  
19 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
20  
21 **FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

22 \_\_\_\_\_ )  
23 **United States of America,** )

24 Plaintiff, )

25 v. )

26 **Douglas A. Ducey, in his official capacity as** )  
27 **Governor of the State of Arizona; the State** )  
28 **of Arizona; the Arizona Department of** )  
**Emergency and Military Affairs; Kerry L.** )  
**Muehlenbeck, in her official capacity as** )  
**Adjutant General, Arizona Department of** )  
**Emergency and Military Affairs; and Allen** )  
**Clark, in his official capacity as Director of** )  
**the Arizona Division of Emergency** )  
**Management, Arizona Department of** )  
**Emergency and Military Affairs,** )

29 Defendants. )

No. CV-22-02107-PHX-SMB

**STIPULATION**

1 This Stipulation is entered into by and between Plaintiff United States of America  
2 and Defendants Douglas A. Ducey, Governor of the State of Arizona, et al. (hereinafter  
3 “Arizona”) to avoid the United States moving for an immediate temporary restraining  
4 order and/or preliminary injunction.

5 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS AGREED BY AND BETWEEN THE PARTIES,  
6 BY AND THROUGH UNDERSIGNED COUNSEL, AS FOLLOWS:

7 1. Arizona agrees to maintain its cessation of activity on National Forest  
8 System lands within the Coronado National Forest for any purpose relating to installing  
9 shipping containers along the international border (where “installing” includes, but is not  
10 limited to, movement of equipment, staging, roadwork, welding, and installation of  
11 concertina wire). In moving shipping containers, equipment, and construction materials  
12 to cease its installation activities, Arizona will confer with representatives from the U.S.  
13 Forest Service for safety purposes and to avoid and minimize damage to the United  
14 States’ lands, properties, and natural resources.

15 2. By January 4, 2023, to the extent feasible and so as not to cause damage to  
16 United States’ lands, properties, and natural resources, Arizona will remove all  
17 previously installed shipping containers and associated equipment, materials, vehicles,  
18 and other objects from the United States’ properties in the U.S. Border Patrol Yuma  
19 Sector, including from lands over which the U.S. Bureau of Reclamation holds an  
20 easement on the Cocopah Indian Tribe’s West Reservation. In taking such action,  
21 Arizona will confer with representatives from Reclamation and U.S. Customs and  
22 Border Protection for safety purposes, for sequencing removal, and to avoid and  
23 minimize damage to United States’ lands, properties, and natural resources or disruption  
24 to federal actions or activities within the Yuma Sector, including commencement of  
25 engineered barrier construction by U.S. Customs and Border Protection in and around  
26 the Morelos Dam area.

27  
28

1           3.       Arizona will, to the extent feasible so as not to cause damage to National  
2 Forest System lands and resources, remove all previously installed shipping containers  
3 and associated equipment, materials, vehicles, and other objects from the United States’  
4 properties on National Forest System lands within the Coronado National Forest. In  
5 taking such action, Arizona will confer with representatives from the U.S. Forest Service  
6 for safety purposes, for sequencing removal, and to avoid and minimize damage to  
7 United States’ lands, properties, and natural resources or disruption to federal actions or  
8 activities within the Coronado National Forest. Discussions between Arizona and the  
9 Forest Service for accomplishing this task will begin within one week.

10           4.       The Parties acknowledge that the safety and security of personnel working  
11 to remove the shipping containers in accordance with Paragraphs 1 to 3 above are  
12 important objectives in the removal of the shipping containers. No specific action by  
13 any party is required if it is reasonably determined that these objectives are  
14 compromised. Under such a situation, the points of contact from the state and federal  
15 agencies will consult in good faith to resolve any issues. If such resolution is not  
16 possible at that level, counsel for the Parties will discuss an appropriate course of action  
17 to ensure the joint objectives of the entirety of this Stipulation.

18           5.       Each Party is responsible for any act or omission by itself or its employees,  
19 agencies, contractors, or agents that results in the death of or injury to any person, or loss  
20 of or damage to any real or personal property of any person.

21           6.       The Parties acknowledge and agree that this Stipulation is not a waiver of  
22 any rights, claims, liabilities, or defenses.

23  
24           IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED:

25  
26           Respectfully submitted this 21st day of December, 2022,

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

GARY M. RESTAINO  
United States Attorney  
District of Arizona

TODD KIM  
Assistant Attorney General  
Environment & Natural Resources Division  
United States Department of Justice

/s/ Andrew A. Smith

---

ANDREW A. SMITH  
(NM Bar No. 8341)  
Senior Trial Attorney  
Natural Resources Section  
c/o United States Attorney's Office  
201 Third Street, N.W., Suite 900  
P.O. Box 607  
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87103  
Phone: (505) 224 1468  
andrew.smith@usdoj.gov

SHAUN M. PETTIGREW  
(Calif. Bar No. 254564)  
Senior Trial Attorney  
Natural Resources Section  
c/o NOAA, Damage Assessment  
7600 Sand Point Way, NE  
Seattle, Washington 98155  
Phone: (206) 526-6881  
shaun.pettigrew@usdoj.gov

TYLER M. ALEXANDER  
(Calif. Bar No. 313188)  
Trial Attorney  
Natural Resources Section  
PO Box 7611  
Washington, DC 20044-7611  
Phone: (202) 305-0238  
tyler.alexander@usdoj.gov

*Attorneys for the United States*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

/s/ Anni L. Foster (electronically approved  
12/21/2022

Anni L. Foster  
OFFICE OF ARIZONA GOVERNOR  
DOUGLAS A. DUCEY  
1700 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

/s/ Brett W. Johnson (electronically approved  
12/21/2022

Brett W. Johnson  
Colin P. Ahler  
Ryan J. Regula  
Charlene A. Warner  
SNELL & WILMER L.L.P.  
1 E. Washington St., Suite 2700  
Phoenix, AZ 85004

*Attorneys for Defendants Douglas A.  
Ducey, Governor of the State of  
Arizona, et al.*